



Inconsistencies in Halal Certification Regulations and Cosmetic Notifications: A Legal Analysis from the Perspectives of Health Law and Consumer Protection



Yatini¹ , Izzatul Muna² , Prima Maharani Putri³ 

¹ Faculty of Law, Widya Gama Mahakam Samarinda, Indonesia

² Istanbul Sabahattin Zaim University, Turkey

³ Faculty of Medicine, Universitas Muhammadiyah Purwokerto, Indonesia

Corresponding: yatini@uwgm.ac.id

Received: 2025-04-13 | Accepted: 2025-09-30 | Published: 2025-11-30

Abstract

Halal certification and cosmetic notification are two essential regulatory regimes within Indonesia's product supervision system. However, overlapping authority between the National Agency of Drug and Food Control (BPOM) and the Halal Product Assurance Organizing Agency (BPJPH) under the Ministry of Religious Affairs has led to regulatory disharmony, resulting in inefficient licensing procedures and legal uncertainty. This study examines the implications of regulatory fragmentation on consumer protection and the right to public health. Using a normative juridical approach and supported by the theories of legal certainty, health law, and consumer protection, the findings indicate that the dualism of the licensing system leads to high transaction costs, delays in product distribution, and a decline in consumer trust in the safety and halal status of products. From the perspective of health law, this disharmony contradicts the principle of the right to health as stipulated in Law No. 17 of 2023. This study proposes a digital-based integrated licensing model for halal certification and cosmetic notification through a single-window system, which may enhance regulatory oversight, improve bureaucratic efficiency, and strengthen consumer protection by ensuring both product safety and the fulfilment of religious values.

Keywords: Cosmetic Notification; Halal Certification; Health Law

I. Introduction

The cosmetics industry in Indonesia is experiencing rapid growth, driven by increasing public awareness of aesthetics and the significance of religious values, particularly the halal status of products. However, the regulatory framework governing the safety and halal compliance of cosmetic products remains fragmented. Halal certification is overseen by the Halal Product Assurance Agency (BPJPH), while cosmetic notifications are managed by the Food and Drug

Supervisory Agency (BPOM). These two processes operate independently, leading to overlapping authorities, higher administrative costs, and legal uncertainties for businesses.

As a result, business operators are required to follow two different licensing pathways, each with its own set of document requirements and procedures. This lack of synchronization leads to higher transaction costs, delays in getting products to market, and ultimately undermines consumer confidence. From the consumer's viewpoint, these inconsistencies create confusion about information, diminish the sense of security when using cosmetic products, and obscure the guarantees of halal compliance and product safety.

From the perspective of health law and consumer protection, this situation violates the principle of the right to information and the guarantees for safe products. Specifically, Law Number 8 of 1999 regarding Consumer Protection and Law Number 17 of 2023 concerning Health stipulate that every consumer has the right to products that are safe, of good quality, and align with their religious values. Therefore, a legal study is needed to examine the inconsistencies between these regulations and propose a more integrated licensing model.

Recent studies have highlighted the importance of regulatory harmonization in ensuring the safety and legal clarity of cosmetic products, particularly in countries with a Muslim majority, such as Indonesia. For instance, Parray and Mokhtar¹ argue that fragmented halal certification processes and lack of institutional coordination can significantly affect consumer behavior and trust in halal-labeled cosmetic products.

This is in line with the findings of Yuanitasari & Suparto, who emphasized that having separate halal and health regulations undermines consumer protection regarding health rights and clarity of information, especially for SMEs in regions like Kupang.² In the ASEAN context, the success of Malaysia's integrated halal system, both institutionally and digitally, demonstrates that supervision of halal products and cosmetics can be managed more efficiently and credibly.³

Several previous studies have examined aspects of halal licensing. Notably, Muhammad Yusuf Ibrahim et al. discussed the regulatory transformation from LPPOM-MUI to BPJPH,⁴ Minabari and Arsyad highlighted the importance of halal brand awareness in the cosmetics industry.⁵ Another study by Azhar Alam and Refita Yunie Samhuri analyzed the halal certification procedures after the enactment of PP No. 31 of 2019,⁶ while Anita Rizkia Rahma and Rifqi Ridlo Phahlevy identified various obstacles in fulfilling halal compliance in Indonesia.⁷ However, these studies are still partial and have not comprehensively integrated the perspectives of health law and consumer protection into a complete supervisory system.

¹ Thomas Christian Parray, & Hamid Husein Mokhtar. (2024). Analyzing Halal Certification Processes, Consumer Behavior, and Regulatory Landscape in Batam City, Indonesia. *Law and Economics*, 18(1), 12-22.

² Deviana Yuanitasari dan Susilowati Suparto, *Tantangan Regulasi Halal untuk Pelaku Usaha Mikro dan Kecil: Sebuah Studi Sosial-Legal di Kupang, Nusa Tenggara Timur*, *Acta Diurnal: Jurnal Ilmu Hukum Kenotariatan* 6, no. 2 (2023): 254-267.

³ Siti Navillah Zulkifli et al., *Maqasid Syariah and Digital Transformation of Halal Supply Chain With Governance Elements, conference proceedings* (2023), Pg. 113-124.

⁴ Ibrahim, M. Y., Fauzi, U., Fadillah, N., & Satifa, S. A. (2023). The Transformation of Halal Certification Regulations in Indonesia. *Jurnal Ekonomi Syariah*, 8(2), 183-195.

⁵ Minabari, E. S., & Arsyad, M. R. P. S. (2024). Strengthening Halal Brand and Awareness in the Halal-Based Pharmaceutical and Cosmetic Industry in Indonesia. *Riwayat: Educational Journal of History and Humanities*, 7 (4), 2754-2763.

⁶ Alam, A., & Samhuri, R. Y. (2021). Halal Certification Management Procedure for Cosmetic Products in Indonesia After Government Regulation Number 31 of 2019: Prosedur Pengelolaan Sertifikasi Halal pada Produk Kosmetik Pasca Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 31 Tahun 2019. *El-Qist: Journal of Islamic Economics and Business (JIEB)*, 11(2), 114-135.

⁷ Rahma, A. R., & Phahlevy, R. R. (2024). Overcoming barriers to improve halal compliance in Indonesia. *Indonesian Journal of Law and Economics Review*, 19(3), 10-21070.

Therefore, this study aims to analyze the legal and normative impacts resulting from the lack of synchronization between halal certification regulations and cosmetic notifications. This misalignment affects the implementation of the right to health and consumer protection. Additionally, the study proposes a digital-based, integrated one-stop regulation model as a solution to resolve the dualism in licensing processes. The novelty of this research lies in its integrative approach, which combines health, consumer protection, and religious values into a single, efficient licensing system that provides legal certainty for all stakeholders. It is expected that this model will enhance the government's responsibility in ensuring that safe, halal, and affordable products are available to the community.

The lack of an integrated information and supervision system between BPOM and BPJPH undermines consumer access to accurate and timely information about product safety and halal compliance. This situation contradicts the principles of transparency and the right to information guaranteed by the Consumer Protection Law. Fatonah et al. argue that consumer trust in halal skincare products depends significantly on the availability of reliable certification data and product safety assurances through accessible information systems.⁸

The significance of this research lies in its contribution to the harmonization of licensing regulations in Indonesia by offering a concrete solution to the persistent regulatory dualism between BPOM and BPJPH. By integrating perspectives from health law and consumer protection, this study provides a comprehensive legal framework that addresses both procedural inefficiencies and the erosion of consumer rights. The findings are expected to serve as a foundation for regulatory reform, enhance the protection of Muslim consumers, and promote good governance in public service delivery related to cosmetic and halal product licensing. The lack of synchronization between public regulations is a failure to harmonize legal norms that significantly impact the right to health and consumer protection, especially for Indonesia's majority-Muslim population. The coexistence of two parallel regulatory systems without procedural and institutional coordination increases burdens on businesses and creates legal uncertainty in the distribution of cosmetic products.⁹

II. Research Problems

1. How does the lack of synchronization between halal certification regulations and cosmetic notification requirements affect the implementation of the right to health and consumer protection in Indonesia?
2. What are the legal and administrative obstacles arising from the dualism of these regulations for businesses and consumers?
3. How to formulate an effective integrated regulatory model to synergize halal licensing and cosmetic notifications to ensure safe products that are in accordance with religious values?

⁸ Fatonah, N. F., Diana, D. R., Gunariah, F., Nurdiansyah, I., & Syamjani, R. (2025). Consumer Confidence In Halal Skin Care Products In Islamic Economics. *Komitmen: Jurnal Ilmiah Manajemen*, 6(1), 75-80

⁹ Ratna Sofiana, Satria Utama & Abdur Rohim, "The Problems of Halal Certification Regarding Consumer Protection in Malaysia and Indonesia," *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System* 1, no. 3 (2021): 1-16.

III. Research Methods

This article employs a normative legal approach that combines three methods: legislative, conceptual, and comparative. The legislative approach is utilized to analyze the content of regulations concerning halal product assurance and cosmetic notifications. The conceptual approach examines legal theories such as the theory of legal certainty,¹⁰ the theory of legal efficiency,¹¹ the principles of consumer protection and health law.¹²

These theories provide the normative framework to evaluate the fragmented regulatory system examined in this study. The theory of legal certainty, rooted in Kelsen's legal positivism, underscores the need for predictable and harmonized regulation to prevent confusion for both regulators and business actors. The theory of legal efficiency, as proposed by Posner, offers an analytical lens to assess how disjointed regulations increase transaction costs, create redundancy, and reduce competitiveness, particularly for SMEs. Consumer protection principles, as outlined by Howells and Weatherill, emphasize the right to information and safety both of which are undermined when legal mandates are not integrated. Lastly, health law theory affirms that regulatory systems must uphold access to safe, quality, and affordable products, including non-drug items like cosmetics that directly impact public health.

Additionally, a comparative approach is applied to evaluate regulatory practices and integrated licensing systems in other countries, particularly Malaysia. Primary legal sources examined in this article include Law Number 17 of 2023 regarding Health, Law Number 33 of 2014 on Halal Product Assurance, BPOM Regulation Number 21 of 2022 on Procedures for Cosmetic Notification, Government Regulation Number 39 of 2021 on the Implementation of Risk-Based Licensing, and PP Number 42 of 2024 concerning Halal Product Assurance. Secondary legal materials are gathered from legal literature, scientific journals, research findings, and relevant official publications. The analytical method employed involves a systematic interpretation of applicable legal norms, identification of regulatory inconsistencies, and the formulation of an integrated model for halal certification regulations and cosmetic notifications that are both digital and cohesive.

IV. Result and Discussion

1. Regulatory Inconsistency and Its Impact on the Right to Health and Consumer Protection

The regulations for halal certification and cosmetic notifications in Indonesia are not administratively or substantively integrated. As a result, business operators must apply for two separate permits from two different institutions, each with unsynchronized systems and varying document requirements. This duplication extends the licensing process and increases operational costs, which in turn delays product distribution to the market. Moreover, this overlapping procedure creates confusion among consumers regarding the legality and halal status of products.

The dualism of regulation between BPJPH (responsible for halal certification) and BPOM (responsible for cosmetic notification) creates significant legal and administrative obstacles for both business actors and consumers. The fragmented distribution of authority generates

¹⁰ Hans Kelsen, *Pure Theory of Law*, trans. Max Knight (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1967), Pg. 204-210.

¹¹ Richard A. Posner, *Economic Analysis of Law*, 9th ed. (New York: Aspen Publishers, 2014), Pg. 3-28.

¹² Soekidjo Notoatmodjo, *Etika dan Hukum Kesehatan*, (Jakarta: Rineka Cipta, 2010), Pg. 101-110.

regulatory complexity and weakens legal certainty, particularly for small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) navigating overlapping licensing procedures. Research findings indicate that the current regulatory framework still lacks institutional integration and harmonization, resulting in structural and procedural uncertainty that complicates implementation and reduces efficiency in the halal assurance system, ultimately hindering the realization of effective consumer protection.¹³

This situation contradicts the principles of transparency and the right to information as guaranteed by the Consumer Protection Law, which mirrors the findings of Adelia et al., indicating that fragmented halal regulation and poor information integration undermine consumer access to clear and reliable product data, especially in the cosmetics sector.¹⁴

This dualism reflects a violation of the principle of legal certainty, which requires clear, consistent, and predictable regulations to ensure fairness for both consumers and business actors.¹⁵ Fragmentation and disharmony within regulatory frameworks governing cosmetic product supervision have the potential to undermine the effectiveness of consumer protection and public health safeguards. Many countries adopt integrated and comprehensive regulatory models to ensure product safety prior to market distribution. For instance, the European Union, through Regulation (EC) No. 1223/2009, requires pre-market safety assessment, toxicological evaluation for each ingredient, and a product safety report as prerequisites for circulation, serving as preventive protection for consumers.¹⁶ Other studies demonstrate that regulatory harmonization and institutional coordination are key factors in guaranteeing cosmetic safety and legal certainty, as fragmented regulatory authority increases administrative complexity and the risk of legal uncertainty.¹⁷ Furthermore, a comparative analysis between the European Union and the United States illustrates that integrated oversight and transparency of information constitute essential components of consumer protection and the safeguarding of the right to health.¹⁸ Such comparative regulatory models emphasize the importance of integrated legal norms and coordinated institutional mechanisms in ensuring consumer safety and fostering a fair and healthy business environment. This condition violates the principle of legal certainty, which requires regulations to be clear, consistent, and coordinated to prevent confusion for both consumers and business actors. Legal certainty is essential so that public regulations including product regulation can be implemented fairly and predictably, thereby ensuring that the rights and obligations of all parties are effectively protected.¹⁹

Administratively, this dualism forces businesses to navigate two separate bureaucratic processes, leading to additional costs and the potential for redundant testing. As a result, there are delays in distribution, increased product prices, and disruptions to the affordability of cosmetic products as part of health access. Although cosmetics are not classified as drugs, they are still considered products that impact skin health and metabolism. Kuncoro emphasized that regulation of cosmetics deserves the same attention as other non-drug health products, especially

¹³ Brian Fina Marliana, Abdul Rokhim, Farahwati, *The Urgency of Halal Certification in Ensuring Legal Certainty for Muslim Consumers*. *Awang Long Law Review* 7, no. 2 (2025): 301-307

¹⁴ Chafizah Adelia, Tarmidzi & Hairus Saleh, *Regulasi Jaminan Produk Halal Sebagai Bentuk Perlindungan Hukum Terhadap Konsumen Muslim Dalam Produk Kosmetik*, *El Hisbah: Journal of Islamic Economic Law* 5, no. 1 (2023): 1-14.

¹⁵ Hans Kelsen, *Loc.Cit*

¹⁶ Regulation and Safety of Cosmetics: Pre- and Post-Market Approaches, *Cosmetics* Vol. 11 No. 6 (2024)

¹⁷ Ruohonen, Jukka, *A Review of Product Safety Regulations in the European Union* (arXiv, 2021)

¹⁸ Foley, Devan R., *The Cosmetic Industry: Comparing the Industry Oversight in the EU and the US*, *Creighton International & Comparative Law Journal* (2019)

¹⁹ Julyano. M., & Sulistyawan, A.Y. (2019). Pemahaman Terhadap Asas Kepastian Hukum Melalui Konstruksi Penalaran Positivisme Hukum Crepido, 1 (1), 13-22

regarding active ingredients and hazardous residues.²⁰ In fact, Articles 7 and 8 of Law Number 17 of 2023 concerning Health explicitly state that the state is obliged to guarantee the availability of safe, quality, and affordable health products.

Regulatory fragmentation significantly impacts supervision, leading to a sector-specific and non-cohesive approach. For example, while cosmetic products may receive notification from BPOM this does not guarantee that they have also obtained halal certification from BPJPH. This disconnect creates ambiguity surrounding the legality and halal status of these products, making it challenging for consumers to make informed choices. According to the theory of *information asymmetry*, when critical product information is inaccessible or unclear, consumers are placed in a weaker bargaining position compared to business actors who control that information.²¹ This situation infringes upon the right to information as outlined in Article 4 letter c and Article 7 letter a of Law Number 8 of 1999 concerning Consumer Protection.

The lack of integration and clarity regarding the halal status and safety of cosmetic products results in consumers missing out on credible information. This condition undermines the core principles of consumer protection particularly the right to information and safety as emphasized by Howells and Weatherill, where transparency is essential for empowering consumers.²² Adelia, Tarmidzi, and Saleh, emphasize that in a one-stop service system, transparent access to information particularly about halal status is crucial for protecting consumers. A deficit in such information weakens consumers' bargaining power and undermines their legal rights in the marketplace.²³ The absence of coordinated information between these two institutions creates an asymmetry that harms consumers. A study by Rahmawati and Pratiwi (2023) indicates that most Muslim consumers in Indonesia still rely on packaging labels for guidance on halal status, even though these labels are frequently uninformative and misleading.²⁴

This condition worsens the information deficit and reduces public trust in the government's oversight system. From the perspective of legal and economic efficiency, unsynchronized regulations increase transaction costs, increase litigation risks, and reduce industrial competitiveness, especially for small and medium enterprises (SMEs).²⁵ These consequences align with *transaction cost economics*, which argues that poorly coordinated regulations result in higher compliance costs and inefficiencies in the market.²⁶

The discrepancy between distribution permits and halal certification can give rise to the potential for legal disputes that are detrimental to both business actors and consumers. Cosmetics, which are products that come into direct contact with the human body, can affect health if they contain hazardous materials. According to health law theory, public authorities are obligated to ensure that health-related products including cosmetics are accessible, safe, and affordable for all citizens.²⁷ Therefore, it is crucial to consider both the safety and clarity of their composition, including the halal status of the ingredients, as part of upholding the public's right

²⁰ Galuh Mekar Kuncoro, *Perlindungan Hukum Bagi Konsumen Terhadap Peredaran Kosmetik Perawatan Wajah Tanpa Notifikasi*, *Novum: Jurnal Hukum* 1, no. 3 (2023): 41–53.

²¹ Geraint Howells and Stephen Weatherill, *Consumer Protection Law*, Ashgate, 2005, Pg. 83.

²² *Ibid*

²³ Chafizah Adelia, Tarmidzi, dan Hairus Saleh *Loc.cit.*

²⁴ *Ibid*

²⁵ Yohanna M. L. Gultom, *Explaining the Informal Sector in Indonesia from the Transaction Costs Perspective*, *Gadjah Mada International Journal of Business* 16, no. 1 (Februari 2014): 23–38.

²⁶ Oliver E. Williamson, *The Economic Institutions of Capitalism*, Free Press, 1985, Pg. 25.

²⁷ Notoatmodjo, *Loc. Cit.*

to health. When the licensing system is fragmented, consumers may encounter products that have not been thoroughly verified for health and religious compliance.²⁸

Furthermore, this condition also damages consumers' rights to legal certainty and information. Law Number 8 of 1999 requires business actors to provide honest and accurate information. However, in practice, the absence of label integration means that consumers cannot distinguish between products that have been certified halal and those that only have BPOM distribution permits. This causes two forms of loss: first, substantive loss due to the lack of guarantee that the product has gone through integrated verification; and second, normative loss due to the loss of the right to information. As a result, consumers cannot make informed choices, which are conscious consumption decisions based on complete, accurate, and accessible information thereby violating their fundamental right to informed choice.²⁹

A recent study by Hakim et al. found that most Indonesian consumers still regard the halal label as a guarantee of safety and compliance with Sharia principles.³⁰ However, the absence of a unified monitoring and information system renders product labels ambiguous and leaves room for potential misuse and misrepresentation. This not only violates consumer rights but also reveals fundamental weaknesses in national regulatory governance. Regulatory frameworks must embody transparency, accountability, and institutional coordination to effectively serve their public protection function. Recent analyses of cosmetic regulation in Indonesia highlight that weak oversight, insufficient information disclosure, and regulatory fragmentation allow unsafe or unverified cosmetic products to circulate undermining consumer safety and public health.³¹

To address these issues, regulatory reform is necessary to create a unified halal information system and ensure the safety of cosmetic products. This can be achieved through data integration, harmonization of procedures, and the digitalization of licensing services. Faiqoh & suggest that Indonesia can learn from Malaysia's centralized and integrated Halal Assurance System under JAKIM. Such coordination provides clearer regulatory authority, faster processing, and enhanced consumer confidence compared to fragmented systems elsewhere.³²

2. Legal and Administrative Constraints due to Regulatory Dualism

The dualism of regulation between BPJPH (for halal certification) and BPOM (for cosmetic notification) creates various significant legal and administrative obstacles for businesses and consumers. As shown by Suparto et al., the fragmentation of authority between institutions in the licensing system results in increased regulatory complexity, bureaucratic overlap, and legal uncertainty.³³

²⁸ Alam, A., & Yunie Samhuri, R. (2021). Loc. cit

²⁹ Peter Cartwright, *Banks, Consumers and Regulation: Myths and Realities* (Hart Publishing, 1 October 2004)

³⁰ Abdul Hakim, Hajar Sugihantoro, Novia Maulina, Achmad Nasichuddin & Diah Ayu Nicotiana, *The Influence of Perception of Halal Labels and Brand Image on Cosmetic Purchasing Decisions Among Millennials, Indonesian Journal of Halal Research* 6, no. 2 (2024): 110-119.

³¹ Alexsanro G. Simbolon, Muhammad Zayyaan Nasco, Masagus Hexal Rizkian & Achmad Muflihuts Tsaqif, "Efektivitas Regulasi dan Pengawasan Pemerintah dalam Mencegah Manipulasi Komposisi Produk Kosmetik," *Pustaka Cendekia Hukum & Ilmu Sosial* 3, no. 2 (2025): 82-96.

³² Faiz Nur Faiqoh dan Nur Fatwa, *Comparative Study of Halal Certification Mechanism: Indonesia, Malaysia and Mexico, Journal of Middle East and Islamic Studies* 11, no. 1 (2024): 1-19.

³³ Susilowati Suparto, Djanurdi Deviana Yuanitasari & Agus Suwandono, *Harmonisasi dan Sinkronisasi Pengaturan Kelembagaan Sertifikasi Halal Terkait Perlindungan Konsumen Muslim Indonesia, Mimbar Hukum* 28, no. 3 (Oktober 2016): 427-438.

The impact is most evident in four main aspects, namely procedural inefficiency, cost burden, legal risk, and weak competitiveness. First, overlapping jurisdictions and procedures cause bureaucratic inefficiency. The absence of harmonization between institutions encourages business actors, especially SMEs, to undergo two separate licensing processes with unsynchronized documents, systems, and times. Santoso et al. report that perceived certification costs stemming from fragmented systems are a major barrier for SMEs, significantly increasing the compliance burden and reducing operational efficiency.³⁴ This regulatory fragmentation increases transaction costs and leads to inefficiency, as analyzed in Posner's theory of legal efficiency, where uncoordinated rules reduce market responsiveness and economic performance.³⁵

This hampers the smooth distribution and reduces the flexibility of business actors in responding to market dynamics. Second, there is an increasing burden of financial and technical costs. Retesting of raw materials and cosmetic formulations is necessary due to differences in standards between product safety (BPOM) and halal aspects (BPJPH). Cosmetics, which are products that come into direct contact with the human body, can affect health if they contain hazardous materials.³⁶ Although LPPOM MUI has offered integrated testing services, these facilities have not evenly reached SMEs outside Jakarta and other big cities.³⁷

From the perspective of regulatory theory, this reflects a classic case of "regulatory overlap," where two or more regulatory bodies claim jurisdiction over the same subject, resulting in what Black terms "fragmented governance" that decreases regulatory efficiency and coherence.³⁸ Administratively, businesses often undergo multiple bureaucratic procedures, leading to higher costs, redundant testing, distribution delays, and increased product prices, which affect the affordability of cosmetics as health-related products. Although cosmetic products may have BPOM distribution permits, many still do not meet halal requirements. Utari & Tsuruyah found significant implementation gaps in halal certification for cosmetics, indicating that BPOM approval alone is insufficient to guarantee halal compliance.³⁹

This condition illustrates the gap between *substantive compliance* (meeting the actual ethical or religious standards of halal) and *procedural compliance* (obtaining the necessary permits), which, according to Baldwin et al. (2012), weakens the legitimacy of regulatory systems in the eyes of both consumers and producers.⁴⁰ This inconsistency opens up room for product recalls, misuse of the halal logo, and legal disputes that are detrimental to consumers and business actors.

Fourth, regulatory fragmentation reduces the competitiveness of Indonesian halal products in international markets. Empirical studies from Malaysia indicate that halal certification positively influences firms' operational and financial performance, enhances

³⁴ Sugeng Santoso, Selma Alfarisah, Ari Ana Fatmawati & Rian Ubaidillah, *Correlation Analysis of the Halal Certification Process and Perceptions of the Cost of Halal Certification with the Intentions of Food and Beverage SMEs Actors, Religious: Jurnal Studi Agama-Agama dan Lintas Budaya* 5, no. 2 (2023): Pg. 297-308.

³⁵ Posner, Richard A. *Economic Analysis of Law*. 9th ed. New York: Aspen Publishers, 2014.

³⁶ Dewie Saktia Ardiantono, Pertiwi, Mushonnifun Faiz Sugihartanto & Berto Mulia Wibawa, *Analyzing the Challenges, Options, and Implementation Strategies for Halal Supply Chain Management in Indonesian Cosmetics Sector Companies, Journal of Halal Research, Policy & Industry* 1, no. 1 (2022): 27-32.

³⁷ LPPOM MUI, "Realizing Safe and Halal Cosmetics Through Laboratory Testing," Desember 2024, <https://www.halalmui.org>, diakses 10 Juni 2025.

³⁸ Julia Black, "The Emergence of Risk-Based Regulation and the New Public Risk Management in the UK," *Public Law*, 2005 (Summer): 512-548.

³⁹ Dwi Nabilah Nur Utari & Nuril Khikmatus Tsuruyah, *Implementation of Halal Product Guarantee Through Halal Certification on Cosmetic Products in Indonesia, ASEAN Journal of Halal Study* 1, no. 2 (2024): 27-32.

⁴⁰ Baldwin, R., Cave, M., & Lodge, M. *Understanding Regulation: Theory, Strategy, and Practice*. Oxford University Press. (2012)

marketability and consumer trust, and facilitates access to international halal markets factors that strengthen exporters' competitiveness.⁴¹

Meanwhile, Indonesia, despite having the second-largest halal market in the world after India, still faces obstacles in the recognition and export of halal cosmetic products due to the lack of integration of the licensing system. This is reflected in the findings of Nur Aini & Go, who found that export value is hindered by certification redundancy, non-tariff barriers, and regulatory fragmentation that reduce Indonesia's competitiveness in the global halal market.⁴²

The absence of institutional coordination not only impairs market access but also reflects what Scott (2001) identifies as institutional misalignment, where regulatory bodies fail to achieve functional complementarity in a single sector.⁴³ Administrative and legal obstacles arising from regulatory dualism are no longer merely technical in nature, but touch on the roots of structural problems, such as limited licensing service infrastructure, disharmony of standards between institutions, and the lack of an integrated digital system.

Therefore, a systemic breakthrough is needed in the form of harmonization of Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs), development of a digital-based one-stop service module, and provision of integrated halal and cosmetic safety testing facilities. This aligns with the concept of *regulatory integration*, which seeks to unify fragmented licensing systems into a coherent whole, thereby increasing legal certainty and administrative efficiency.⁴⁴ Streamlining halal certification through regulatory integration is expected to reduce compliance costs, minimize legal uncertainties, and enhance the competitiveness of Indonesian products, particularly in the modest fashion and cosmetic sectors, both domestically and globally.⁴⁵

3. Integrated Regulatory Model for Integration of Halal Certification and Cosmetic Notification

Building on the need for regulatory synergy, this study supports a digital-based halal-cosmetic integrated licensing model through a single window system, as proposed by Nihayati, to bridge the gap between safety and halal certification regimes and enhance administrative efficiency and consumer access to information.⁴⁶

The solution offered is an integrated service system that combines the halal certification process by BPJPH and cosmetic notification by BPOM into one national digital platform. This model is equipped with a shared database, combined standard procedures, and an integrated risk-based audit mechanism. To implement this model effectively, it requires the establishment of a cross-ministerial/institutional coordinating body, revision of overlapping regulations, and initial trials through pilot projects in developing cosmetic industry areas such as Bandung and Surabaya. This mirrors the findings of Hasmita et al, who showed that multi-stakeholder

⁴¹ Ab Talib MS, Ai Chin T, Fischer J (2017), "Linking Halal food certification and business performance". *British Food Journal*, Vol. 119 No. 7 pp. 1606-1618.

⁴² Nur Aini and Riska Tezara Go, *How is the correlation between Halal Certification and the Growth of Indonesia's Export Economic Value?*, *Halal Research Journal* 5, no. 1 (Februari 2025): 59-70.

⁴³ Scott, C. *Analysing Regulatory Space: Fragmented Resources and Institutional Design*. *Public Law*, 2001(Autumn), 329-353.

⁴⁴ Braithwaite, J. (2006). Responsive regulation and developing economies. *World Development*, 34(5), 884-898

⁴⁵ Arina Nihayati. (2025). Integrating Halal Certification in Free Trade Agreements: Indonesia's Modest Fashion and Cosmetics. *Jurnal Hubungan Internasional*, 18(1), 28-47.

⁴⁶ Ibid

collaborative governance among regulatory agencies, industry actors, and laboratories enhances regulatory effectiveness and consumer protection in Indonesia's cosmetic sector.⁴⁷

Conceptually, this model adopts the "Integrated Regulatory Governance" approach, which emphasizes regulatory coherence, inter-agency coordination, and digital interoperability in licensing systems. According to Gunningham and Sinclair, integrated governance enhances compliance and reduces regulatory burden through institutional synergy and streamlined procedures.⁴⁸

This integration model includes the following main elements:

a. Integrated Database between BPJPH and BPOM

This integration is necessary to ensure transparency and consumer confidence, as shown in Malaysia's digital halal system which enhances trust and integrity. As observed by Zulkifli et al., Malaysia's digital transformation including e-certificates, online verification tools, and real-time tracking has significantly improved governance within JAKIM's halal assurance system, bolstering consumer trust and regulatory integrity.⁴⁹ The lack of effective coordination between BPOM and BPJPH undermines the enforcement of halal and safety standards in Indonesia's cosmetics sector. Without a unified regulatory and monitoring system, product labeling remains ambiguous and enforcement becomes inconsistent, increasing the risk of unsafe or misleading products circulating in the market. Research shows that fragmented authority over halal certification and product regulation weakens consumer protection and erodes public trust in regulatory governance.⁵⁰ The proposed model is also consistent with the principles of digital governance, which emphasizes the use of technology to streamline public services and improve accountability and citizen access. As Reggi and Dawes argue, effective e-government frameworks require not only the deployment of technological tools, but also institutional capacity, cross-agency collaboration, and stakeholder engagement to ensure value creation and sustainability of digital governance.⁵¹

b. Joint Standard Procedure (SOP)

Unifying the stages of application, verification and evaluation of permits, to avoid duplication of processes and speed up service duration.

c. Risk-Based Joint Audit Mechanism

Implementing a comprehensive approach from upstream to downstream starting from raw materials, production processes, to distribution.⁵²

d. Institutional Coordination

Involving the Ministry of Health, Ministry of Industry, and Coordinating Ministry for Human Development and Culture as cross-sector directors and supervisors. This aligns with the good regulatory governance framework, where institutional coordination and policy coherence are essential in preventing overlapping mandates. According to the OECD (2021), regulatory

⁴⁷ Wiwi Hasmita, Muhammad Alwy Arifin, dkk., *Collaborative Governance in Combating Illegal Cosmetics: A Study of Multi-Stakeholder Dynamics in South Sulawesi, Indonesia, Integrative Biomedical Research (Journal of Angiotherapy)* 9, no. 1 (2025): 1-12.

⁴⁸ Gunningham, N., & Sinclair, D. *Leaders and Laggards: Next-Generation Environmental Regulation*. Greenleaf Publishing, (2002).

⁴⁹ Siti Navillah Zulkifli et al., *Maqasid Syariah and Digital Transformation of Halal Supply Chain With Governance Elements, conference proceedings* (2023), Pg. 113-124, diakses 28 Juli 2025

⁵⁰ ZA. Suhardi et al., "Analisis Peran BPOM dan BPJPH dalam Pengawasan Produk Kosmetik dan Jaminan Halal," *Jurnal Penelitian Inovatif (JUPIN)* Vol. 5, No. 4 (2025): 3169-3180.

⁵¹ Luigi Reggi & Sharon S. Dawes, *Creating Open Government Data Ecosystems: Network Relations Among Governments, User Communities, NGOs and the Media, Government Information Quarterly* 39, no. 2 (2022): Article 101675.

⁵² Nur Aini and Riska Tezara Go, *How is the correlation between Halal Certification and the Growth of Indonesia's Export Economic Value? Halal Research Journal* 5, no. 1 (Februari 2025): 59-70.

integration should not only focus on procedure simplification but also address structural fragmentation within the regulatory ecosystem.⁵³

e. Regional Pilot Project

Implemented in strategic cosmetic industrial areas, as a policy laboratory for institutional and technical evaluation of the system.⁵⁴ In addition to testing technical feasibility, pilot projects in peripheral regions could reduce regulatory inequality. Fragmented regulations tend to privilege large-scale producers, while SMEs often face disproportionate compliance costs, reinforcing structural barriers in access to halal certification and market entry. Ardiantono et al. (2022) show that UMKM in Indonesia's cosmetic sector incur higher relative compliance burdens due to fragmented procedures and lack of system integration, while larger firms with institutional capacity enjoy economies of scale that smaller players cannot leverage.⁵⁵

This model reflects a transition toward a "Whole-of-Government" approach in regulatory practice, where policy implementation no longer operates in institutional silos but rather through horizontal collaboration.⁵⁶ This is aligned with the OECD recommendation on regulatory policy, which advocates for digital transformation and risk-based regulation as key pillars of good regulatory practice.⁵⁷

The model adopts international best practices, especially the integrated Halal Assurance System implemented by the Malaysian Islamic Development Agency (JAKIM). This approach is well demonstrated in comparative research by Zaharah et al.,⁵⁸ which highlights Malaysia's centralized and integrated method under JAKIM contrasting with the fragmented mechanism in Indonesia as a model that enhances regulatory clarity, processing efficiency, and consumer trust.

Halal certification functions not only as a regulatory compliance tool but also as a marketing and competitiveness instrument. Studies from Malaysia show that certification positively influences firm performance, marketability, and consumer trust which can enhance the global competitiveness of halal-certified products.⁵⁹ A study by Nurindra & Nurwahidin demonstrated that the success of Malaysia's halal assurance system is rooted in institutional integration, digital certification processes (e.g. MyEHalal system), and continuous oversight along the value chain elements that enhance consumer confidence and regulatory integrity.⁶⁰

In Indonesia itself, the legal basis for implementing this system has been provided through Presidential Regulation Number 39 of 2021 concerning Simplification of Risk-Based Licensing, which allows synergy between institutions in the context of ease of doing business. The implementation of an integrated licensing system, such as Indonesia's Online Single Submission (OSS), has opened the door for regulatory consolidation. However, it has yet to impact the halal cosmetics sector. A comparative study by Afdhal et al. indicates that Malaysia is more advanced in operating a government-based Single Window System for halal certification, whereas

⁵³ Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), *Regulatory Policy Outlook 2021* (Paris: OECD Publishing, 6 October 2021).

⁵⁴ LPPOM MUI, *Loc.cit*

⁵⁵ Dewie Saktia Ardiantono, Pertiwi, Mushonnifun Faiz Sugihartanto & Berto Mulia Wibawa, *Loc. Cit.*

⁵⁶ Christensen, T., & Lægreid, P., "The Whole-of-Government Approach to Public Sector Reform," *Public Administration Review* 67, no. 6 (2007): 1059-1066.

⁵⁷ OECD. *Loc.cit.*

⁵⁸ Rita Zaharah, Nik Airin Aqmar bt Nik Azhar, Lily Faizal, Rudi Santoso & Indah Satria, *Halal Industry: A Comparative Analysis of Halal Certification Mechanisms in Indonesia and Malaysia from the Perspective of Sharia Economic Law*, *ASAS: International Journal of Economics and Sharia Economics* 16, no. 2 (2023): 105-124.

⁵⁹ Mohamed Syazwan Ab Talib, Thoo Ai Chin, Abu Bakar Abdul Hamid, Halal Food Certification and Business Performance in Malaysia. Emerald Publishing Limited, *British Food Journal*, Jilid 119, (7)1606-1618.

⁶⁰ Nurindra, Miura Sekar and Nurwahidin, Nurwahidin (2025) "Comparative Study of Halal Certification Procedures in Southeast Asia and Middle Eastern Countries," *Journal Of Middle East and Islamic Studies*: Vol. 12: No. 1, Article 6.

Indonesia’s licensing framework remains fragmented between BPJPH and BPOM.⁶¹ The model also embodies the principles of *Smart Regulation*, which seeks to minimize administrative complexity while maximizing compliance effectiveness through innovation, coordination, and technology.⁶²

The reform of the risk-based licensing system as stipulated in Presidential Regulation Number 39 of 2021 has opened up opportunities for integration between institutions. However, without strong institutional coordination, the dualism of BPJPH and BPOM still creates a regulatory burden. As demonstrated by Mirozul et al, risk-based licensing reform requires accompanying adjustments in institutional structures to achieve efficiency and responsiveness.⁶³

The implementation of this model is projected to provide the following concrete benefits:

- a. Time and cost efficiency: Eliminating duplicate processes and repeated testing, which greatly benefits SMEs.
- b. Increasing legal certainty and transparency: Ensuring that consumers' rights to information are met accurately. This is in line with the findings of Alamsyah, who emphasized the need for consistent halal labeling regulations to guarantee consumer trust and legal clarity.⁶⁴
- c. Increasing the competitiveness of national products: Increasing export value and trust in the international halal market.
- d. Strengthening institutional synergy: Encouraging adaptive and collaborative regulatory governance across sectors.

As an illustration, here is a comparison scheme of the process before and after implementing the integrated model:

Table 1. Process Flow Comparison Before and After Integrated

Before Integrated	After Integrated
Business actors apply for 2 separate permits (BPOM & BPJPH)	Business actors apply for 1 permit through a digital system
Different systems and documents	Integrated documents and systems
Duplication of verification & audits	Combined audits and verifications
Consumers have difficulty checking halal & safety information	Consumers access 1 system for all product statuses
High time and cost	More efficient time and costs

With this model, the halal and cosmetic licensing system is no longer a bureaucratic barrier but rather becomes a strategic tool for consumer protection and the strengthening of the national halal industry. The novelty of this study lies in its integrated legal analysis that combines regulatory, institutional, and digital policy perspectives to propose a coherent licensing model that accommodates both health protection and religious values. This multidimensional

⁶¹ Afdhal Afdhal, Andi Santri Syamsuri & Mutiara Dwi Sari, *Legal Compliance in the Registration and Issuance of Halal Certificates in Indonesia: A Comparative Study with Malaysia*, *Al-Bayyinah* 9, no. 1 (2024): Pg. 1-14

⁶² Gunningham, Neil, Peter Grabosky, and Darren Sinclair, *Smart Regulation: Designing Environmental Policy* (Oxford, 1998; online edn, Oxford Academic, 31 Oct. 2023), accessed 17 Nov. 2025

⁶³ Mirozul, A., Wati, D. S., & Meliala, A. J. (2025). Risk-Based Business Licensing According Perspective of Investment Certainty in Indonesia. *Journal of Progressive Law and Legal Studies*, 3(02), 254-268.

⁶⁴ Grisna Anggadwita, Dini Turipanam Alamanda & Veland Ramadani, *Halal Label vs Product Quality in Halal Cosmetic Purchasing Decisions*, *IKONOMIKA* 4, no. 2 (2023): 1-19.

formulation offers a new academic framework for addressing fragmented regulation in the halal-cosmetic sector.

V. Conclusion

The lack of synchronization between halal certification regulations managed by BPJPH and cosmetic notifications overseen by BPOM creates obstacles in the consumer protection system and undermines public health guarantees. This dualism results in procedural inefficiencies, increased costs, litigation risks, and a decline in public trust regarding the legality and halal status of cosmetic products. Furthermore, it disrupts consumers' rights to accurate information and safe products that align with their religious values.

Analysis indicates that integrating halal licensing and cosmetic notifications through a unified digital system is an urgent strategic solution. This approach should be based on enhanced coordination between institutions, harmonized procedures, and the utilization of information technology infrastructure. Such integration not only strengthens the effectiveness of oversight but also reflects the state's responsibility to ensure health rights and consumer protection.

As a recommendation, it is essential to reformulate regulations that enable the integration of licensing procedures into a single digital service platform. Additionally, developing pilot projects in key areas of the cosmetic industry can serve as models for implementation and promote stronger institutional synergy among BPOM, BPJPH, and other relevant ministries.

References

- Alam, A., & Samhuri, R. Y. (2021). Halal Certification Management Procedure for Cosmetic Products in Indonesia After Government Regulation Number 31 of 2019: *Prosedur Pengelolaan Sertifikasi Halal pada Produk Kosmetik Pasca Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 31 Tahun 2019*. *El-Qist: Journal of Islamic Economics and Business (JIEB)*, 11(2), 114-135; DOI: 10.15642/elqist.2021.11.2.114-135;
- Abdul Hakim, Hajar Sugihantoro, Novia Maulina, Achmad Nasichuddin & Diah Ayu Nicotiana, *The Influence of Perception of Halal Labels and Brand Image on Cosmetic Purchasing Decisions Among Millennials*, *Indonesian Journal of Halal Research* 6, no. 2 (2024): 110–119, <https://doi.org/10.15575/ijhar.v6i2.37077>
- Arina Nihayati “Integrating Halal Certification in Free Trade Agreements: Indonesia’s Modest Fashion and Cosmetics” *Jurnal Hubungan Internasional*, Vol. 18, No. 1 (2025) <https://e-journal.unair.ac.id/JHI/article/view/70968>;
- Ab Talib MS, Ai Chin T, Fischer J (2017), “Linking Halal foodcertification and business performance”. *British Food Journal*, Vol.119 No. 7 pp.1606-1618, <https://doi.org/10.1108/BFJ-01-2017-0019>
- Afdhal Afdhal, Andi Santri Syamsuri & Mutiara Dwi Sari, *Legal Compliance in the Registration and Issuance of Halal Certificates in Indonesia: A Comparative Study with Malaysia*, *Al-Bayyinah* 9, no.1 (2024): Pg. 1–14, <https://doi.org/10.30863/al-bayyinah.v9i1.8974>;
- Aini, N., & Go, R. T. (2025). How is the correlation between Halal Certification and the Growth of Indonesia’s Export Economic Value?. *al research ournal*, 5(1), 59–70. <https://doi.org/10.12962/j22759970.v5i1.2516>;

- Alexsanro Gabe Simbolon, Muhammad Zayyaan Nasco, Masagus Hexal Rizkian, & Achmad Muflihuts Tsaqif. (2025). Efektivitas Regulasi dan Pengawasan Pemerintah dalam Mencegah Manipulasi Komposisi Produk Kosmetik : Kajian Hukum dan Kesehatan. *Jurnal Pustaka Cendekia Hukum Dan Ilmu Sosial*, 3(2), 82–96. <https://doi.org/10.70292/pchukumsosial.v3i2.133>
- Black, J. (2005). The Emergence of Risk-Based Regulation and the New Public Risk Management in the United Kingdom. *Public Law*, 512-548. <https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/The-Emergence-of-Risk-Based-Regulation-and-the-New-Black/7ad0f3a7f7c360d1fc4e9a22aa95719ee6842782>;
- Baldwin, Robert, Martin Cave, and Martin Lodge, *Understanding Regulation: Theory, Strategy, and Practice*, 2nd edn (Oxford, 2011; online edn, Oxford Academic, 20 Apr. 2015), accessed 26 Nov. 2025., <https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:osobl/9780199576081.001.0001>;
- Brian Fina Marlina, Abdul Rokhim, Farahwati, The Urgency of Halal Certification in Ensuring Legal Certainty for Muslim Consumers. *Awang Long Law Review* 7, no. 2 (2025): 301–307. <https://ejournal.stihawanglong.ac.id/index.php/awl/article/download/1562/932>
- Christensen, T., & Læg Reid, P., “The Whole-of-Government Approach to Public Sector Reform,” *Public Administration Review* 67, no. 6 (2007): 1059–1066. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-6210.2007.00797.x>
- Chafizah Adelia, Tarmidzi, dan Hairus Saleh, Regulasi Jaminan Produk Halal Sebagai Bentuk Perlindungan Hukum Terhadap Konsumen Muslim Dalam Produk Kosmetik, *El Hisbah: Journal of Islamic Economic Law* 5, no.1 (2023): 1–14; DOI: <https://doi.org/10.28918/elhisbah.v5i1.11383>
- Dwi Nabilah Nur Utari & Nuril Khikmatus Tsuroyyah, Implementation of Halal Product Guarantee Through Halal Certification on Cosmetic Products in Indonesia, *ASEAN Journal of Halal Study* 1, no. 2 (2024): 27–32, DOI: <https://doi.org/10.26740/ajhs.v1i2.35528>
- Dewie Saktia Ardiantono, Pertiwi, Mushonnifun Faiz Sugihartanto & Berto Mulia Wibawa, Analyzing the Challenges, Options, and Implementation Strategies for Halal Supply Chain Management in Indonesian Cosmetics Sector Companies, *Journal of Halal Research, Policy & Industry* 1, no.1 (2022): 27–32, diakses 29 Juli 2025, <https://doi.org/10.33086/jhrpi.v1i1.3433>
- Deviana Yuanitasari dan Susilowati Suparto, Tantangan Regulasi Halal untuk Pelaku Usaha Mikro dan Kecil: Sebuah Studi Sosial-Legal di Kupang, Nusa Tenggara Timur, *Acta Diurnal: Jurnal Ilmu Hukum Kenotariatan* 6, no. 2 (2023): 254–267, <https://doi.org/10.23920/acta.v6i2.1474>;
- Faiz Nur Faiqoh dan Nur Fatwa, Comparative Study of Halal Certification Mechanism: Indonesia, Malaysia and Mexico, *Journal of Middle East and Islamic Studies* 11, no. 1 (2024): 1–19, <https://doi.org/10.7454/meis.v11i1.175>,
- Foley, Devan R., *The Cosmetic Industry: Comparing the Industry Oversight in the EU and the US*, *Creighton International & Comparative Law Journal* (2019). <https://creighton-intl-comp-law-journal.scholasticahq.com/article/74351-the-cosmetic-industry-comparing-the-industry-oversight-in-the-european-union-and-the-united-states/stats/all/pageviews>
- Fatonah, N. F., Diana, D. R., Gunariah, F., Nurdiansyah, I., & Syamjani, R. (2025). Consumer Confidence In Halal Skin Care Products In Islamic Economics. *Komitmen: Jurnal Ilmiah Manajemen*, 6(1), 75–80; <https://doi.org/10.15575/jim.v6i1.43799>

- Grisna Anggadwita, Dini Turipanam Alamanda & Veland Ramadani, Halal Label vs Product Quality in Halal Cosmetic Purchasing Decisions, *IKONOMIKA* 4, no. 2 (2023): 1-19, <https://doi.org/10.24042/febi.v4i2.5897>
- Geraint Howells and Stephen Weatherill, *Consumer Protection Law*, Ashgate, 2005, Pg. 83; DOI <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315259512>
- Galuh Mekar Kuncoro, Perlindungan Hukum Bagi Konsumen Terhadap Peredaran Kosmetik Perawatan Wajah Tanpa Notifikasi, *Novum: Jurnal Hukum* 1, no. 3 (2023): 41-53; <https://ejournal.unesa.ac.id/index.php/novum/article/view/10634>;
- Geraint Howells and Stephen Weatherill, *Consumer Protection Law*. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2005. <https://www.taylorfrancis.com/books/mono/10.4324/9781315259512/consumer-protection-law-stephen-weatherill-geraint-howells>
- Gunningham, N., & Sinclair, D. *Leaders and Laggards: Next-Generation Environmental Regulation*. Greenleaf Publishing. (2002). https://doi.org/10.4324/9781351282000?urlappend=%3Futm_source%3Dresearchgate.net%26utm_medium%3Darticle
- Gunningham, Neil, Peter Grabosky, and Darren Sinclair, *Smart Regulation: Designing Environmental Policy* (Oxford, 1998; online edn, Oxford Academic, 31 Oct. 2023), accessed 17 Nov. 2025. <https://doi.org/10.1093/oso/9780198268574.001.0001>
- H. Notoatmodjo, *Etika dan Hukum Kesehatan*. (Jakarta: Rineka Cipta), 2010.
- Ibrahim, M. Y., Fauzi, U., Fadillah, N., & Satifa, S. A. (2023). The Transformation of Halal Certification Regulations in Indonesia. *Jurnal Ekonomi Syariah*, 8(2), 183-195; DOI: 10.37058/jes.v8i2.8463
- Julyano, M., & Sulistyawan, A. Y. (2019). Pemahaman Terhadap Asas Kepastian Hukum Melalui Konstruksi Penalaran Positivisme Hukum. *Crepido*, 1 (1), 13-22. <https://doi.org/10.14710/crepido.1.1.13-22>
- John Braithwaite, Responsive regulation and developing economies, *World Development*, Volume 34, Issue 5, 2006, Pages 884-898, ISSN 0305-750X, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2005.04.021>.
- Kelsen, Hans. *Pure Theory of Law*. Translated by Max Knight. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1967.
- Luigi Reggi, Sharon S. Dawes, Creating Open Government Data ecosystems: Network relations among governments, user communities, NGOs and the media, *Government Information Quarterly*, Volume 39, Issue 2, 2022, 101675, ISSN 0740-624X, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.giq.2022.101675>.
- LPPOM MUI, "Realizing Safe and Halal Cosmetics Through Laboratory Testing," Desember 2024, diakses 10 Juni 2025. <https://halalmui.org/en/lppom-realizing-safe-and-halal-cosmetics-through-laboratory-testing/>
- Minabari, E. S., & Arsyad, M. R. P. S. (2024). Strengthening Halal Brand and Awareness in the Halal-Based Pharmaceutical and Cosmetic Industry in Indonesia. *Riwayat: Educational Journal of History and Humanities*, 7 (4), 2754-2763: <https://doi.org/10.24815/jr.v7i4.40340>
- Mirozul, A., Wati, D. S., & Meliala, A. J. (2025). Risk-Based Business Licensing According Perspective of Investment Certainty in Indonesia. *Journal of Progressive Law and Legal Studies*, 3(02), 254-268. <https://doi.org/10.59653/jplls.v3i02.1723>

- Musaidah, A., Ahmadiono, A., & Masrohatin, S. . (2024). The influence of halal label, price, and brand image on cosmetic product purchase decisions among female students at FEBI UIN KHAS Jember . *Journal of Islamic Economics Lariba*, 10(1), 347-362. <https://doi.org/10.20885/jielariba.vol10.iss1.art19>
- Mohamed Syazwan Ab Talib, Thoo Ai Chin, Abu Bakar Abdul Hamid, Halal Food Certification and Business Performance in Malaysia, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/327719722_Halal_Food_Certification_and_Business_Performance_in_Malaysia
- Nurindra, Miura Sekar and Nurwahidin, Nurwahidin (2025) "Comparative Study of Halal Certification Procedures in Southeast Asia and Middle Eastern Countries," *Journal Of Middle East and Islamic Studies*: Vol. 12: No. 1, Article 6. DOI: 10.7454/meis.v12i1.198, <https://doi.org/10.7454/meis.v12i1.198>
- Nur Aini and Riska Tezara Go, How is the correlation between Halal Certification and the Growth of Indonesia's Export Economic Value?, *Halal Research Journal* 5, no. 1 (Februari 2025): 59-70, <https://doi.org/10.12962/j22759970.v5i1.2516>
- Neil Gunningham, dan Darren Sinclair, *Smart Regulation: Designing Environmental Policy*, (Oxford University Press Clarendon Press), 1998. <https://doi.org/10.22459/RT.02.2017.08>
- Neil Gunningham dan Darren Sinclair, *Leaders and Laggards: Next-Generation Environmental Regulation* (Sheffield, UK: Greenleaf Publishing Ltd, 2002). DOI <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781351282000>
- Oliver E. Williamson, *The Economic Institutions of Capitalism*. (New York: Free Press), 1985. <https://eyrcls.com/en/books-collection/buku-the-economic-institutions-of-capitalism/>
- Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), *Regulatory Policy Outlook 2021* (Paris: OECD Publishing, 6 October 2021), https://www.oecd.org/content/dam/oecd/en/publications/reports/2021/10/oecd-regulatory-policy-outlook-2021_c5274577/38b0fdb1-en.pdf
- Posner, Richard A. *Economic Analysis of Law*. 9th ed. (New York: Aspen Publishers), 2014.
- Peter Cartwright, Banks, *Consumers and Regulation: Myths and Realities* (Hart Publishing, 1 October 2004)
- Regulation and Safety of Cosmetics: Pre- and Post-Market Approaches, *Cosmetics* Vol. 11 No. 6 (2024). <https://www.mdpi.com/2079-9284/11/6/184>
- Ruohonen, Jukka, *A Review of Product Safety Regulations in the European Union* (arXiv, 2021). <https://doi.org/10.48550/arXiv.2102.03679>
- Robert Baldwin, Martin Cave, dan Martin Lodge, *Understanding Regulation: Theory, Strategy, and Practice*. Edisi ke-2. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012. <https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:osobl/9780199576081.001.0001>

- Priatna, R. et. al. 2023. A Comparative Study On Halal Policy In Southeast Asian Countries. *Journal of Halal Product and Research. (JHPR)* 6(2), 77-92, [accessed Dec 01 2025]. from: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/387786231_A_COMPARATIVE_STUDY_ON_HALAL_POLICY_IN_SOUTHEAST_ASIAN_COUNTRIES#fullTextFileContent
- Rita Zaharah, Nik Airin Aqmar bt Nik Azhar, Lily Faizal, Rudi Santoso & Indah Satria, Halal Industry: A Comparative Analysis of Halal Certification Mechanisms in Indonesia and Malaysia from the Perspective of Sharia Economic Law, *ASAS: International Journal of Economics and Sharia Economics* 16, no. 2 (2023): 105–124, <https://doi.org/10.24042/asas.v16i2.23994>
- Ratna Sofiana, Satria Utama & Abdur Rohim, “The Problems of Halal Certification Regarding Consumer Protection in Malaysia and Indonesia,” *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System* 1, no. 3 (2021): 1–16 DOI: 10.53955/jhcls.v1i3.16
- Rahma, A. R. ., & Phahlevy, R. R. (2024). Overcoming Barriers to Improve Halal Compliance in Indonesia: Mengatasi Hambatan untuk Meningkatkan Kepatuhan Halal di Indonesia. *Indonesian Journal of Law and Economics Review*, 19(3), 10.21070/ijler.v19i3.1199. <https://doi.org/10.21070/ijler.v19i3.1199>
- Siti Navillah Zulkifli et al., Maqasid Syariah and Digital Transformation of Halal Supply Chain With Governance Elements, conference proceedings (2023), Pg. 113–124.; DOI: 10.15405/epsbs.2023.11.9
- Susilowati Suparto, Djanurdi Deviana Yunitasari & Agus Suwandono, Harmonisasi dan Sinkronisasi Pengaturan Kelembagaan Sertifikasi Halal Terkait Perlindungan Konsumen Muslim Indonesia, *Mimbar Hukum* 28, no. 3 (Oktober 2016): 427–438; <https://doi.org/10.22146/jmh.16674>
- Satjipto Rahardjo, *Ilmu Hukum*, Citra Aditya Bakti, 2000.
- Scott, C. *Analysing Regulatory Space: Fragmented Resources and Institutional Design*. Public Law, (Autumn), 2001.
- Sugeng Santoso, Selma Alfarisah, Ari Ana Fatmawati & Rian Ubaidillah, Correlation Analysis of the Halal Certification Process and Perceptions of the Cost of Halal Certification with the Intentions of Food and Beverage SMEs Actors, *Religious: Jurnal Studi Agama-Agama dan Lintas Budaya* 5, no. 2 (2023): Pg. 297–308; DOI: <https://doi.org/10.15575/rjsalb.v5i2.11627>
- Thomas Christian Parray, & Hamid Husein Mokhtar. (2024). Analyzing Halal Certification Processes, Consumer Behavior, and Regulatory Landscape in Batam City, Indonesia. *Law and Economics*, 18(1), 12–22. Retrieved from <https://journals.ristek.or.id/index.php/LE/article/view/64>
- Wiwi Hasmita, Muhammad Alwy Arifin, dkk., Collaborative Governance in Combating Illegal Cosmetics: A Study of Multi-Stakeholder Dynamics in South Sulawesi, Indonesia, *Integrative Biomedical Research (Journal of Angiotherapy)* 9, no. 1 (2025): 1–12. https://publishing.emanresearch.org/CurrentIssuePDF/EmanPublisher_1_5936angiotherapy-9110158.pdf

- Wibawa, B. M., & Safira, A. (2024). The Impact Of Halal Compliance On Consumer Satisfaction In The Cosmetic Industry. *Journal of Halal Research, Policy, and Industry*, 3(1), 39-50. <https://doi.org/10.33086/jhrpi.v3i1.6174>
- Yohanna M. L. Gultom, Explaining the Informal Sector in Indonesia from the Transaction Costs Perspective, *Gadjah Mada International Journal of Business* 16, no. 1 (February 2014): 23-38, <https://doi.org/10.22146/gamaijb.5465>
- Yuanitasari, D., Sardjono, A., & Susetyo, H. (2023). Tantangan Regulasi Halal Untuk Pelaku Usaha Mikro Dan Kecil: Sebuah Studi Socio-Legal Di Kupang Nusa Tenggara Timur. *Acta Diurnal Jurnal Ilmu Hukum Kenotariatan*, 6(2), 254 - 267. <https://doi.org/10.23920/acta.v6i2.1474>
- ZA. Suhardi et al., " Analisis Peran BPOM dan BPJPH dalam Pengawasan Produk Kosmetik dan Jaminan Halal," *Jurnal Penelitian Inovatif (JUPIN)* Vol. 5, No. 4 (2025): 3169-3180. <https://doi.org/10.54082/jupin.1943>