THE EFFECTIVENESS OF SIMULATION AND ROLE PLAY TECHNIQUE TO TEACH SPEAKING FOR HIGH AND LOW MOTIVATION STUDENTS

Maria Agustin Daniastuti
A Post Graduated Student of Universitas Negeri Semarang

Abstract
This study’s purpose is to find out the significance of motivation and teaching learning technique effect toward students learning result score on speaking skill. This research was conducted in Tarciusius Vocational School Semarang and took thirty one students as data source. Experimental research was chosen to solve the research question with the help of the SPSS statistical program to increase the accuracy. This research uses employed questionnaire, t-test, and f-test in data collection. Based on the finding, speaking skill learning result by using simulation technique and role play tend to achieve better result on post-test than pre-test. Future testing shows that speaking skill learning result by using simulation technique much better than role play. Other findings show that high motivation students significantly influence toward speaking learning result by using simulation technique and role play. In other hand Low motivation students does not significantly influence toward speaking skill learning result. Finally, this research conclude that simulation technique is appropriate learning technique to improve speaking learning result than role play.

Keyword : Motivation, Simulation Technique, Role play

Introduction
Language cannot be separated from human activities. People share their thoughts, feelings, experiences, and many things with others by using language. Language becomes the main instrument of communication because people use language to conduct communication in their every social interaction. English is one of languages that becomes international language. It means that English is used by many people around the world to communicate or deliver something, includes in teaching and learning process. In Indonesia, English also becomes one of important subjects in national examination for high school level, beside mathematics and Indonesian language subject. Therefore, mastering English is very important.

In order to master English or any language as second, or even, as foreign language, there must be some massive problem especially on speaking skill. first, unlike reading or writing, speaking skill happens in real time; usually the person you are talking to is waiting for you to respond the conversation. This problem caused the conversation become awkward or died immediately. Second, when you speak, there is no time to edit and revise what you wish to say like in writing. These reasons make the speaking skill is very essential skill. not only for our daily life, the kind of skill help us to gather some important information from other people. Lacking these aspect will bring some problem in our future social life. In line with the reason before, Aungwatanakun in Oorade (2012;511) state that ability to speak is most essential skill since it is the basic for communication, include English.

According to Harmer in Solcova (2011) states that role play and simulation increase learners’ self confidence and encourage more hesitant learners to speak because it is not themselves who they present when conversation happens and thus they do not have to take the responsibility for their utterance and actions. Therefore, from the statement of Harmer above stimulate the researcher to conduct similar study. This research combining the simulation technique and role play as teaching technique in English speaking skill to motivate the students that have different motivation.

The objective of the research were as follows: (1) to explain how simulation technique is more effective teaching technique on learning speaking skill; (2) to explain motivated students, high and low motivation students, significantly influence toward speaking skill learning result by using simulation technique; (3) to explain motivated students, high and
low motivation students, significantly influence toward speaking skill learning result by using role play.

**Literature Review**

**Concept of Speaking**

Speaking is "the process of building and sharing meaning through the use of verbal and non-verbal symbols, in a variety of contexts" (Chaney, 1998, cited in Shrouf, 2012). Speaking is an interactive process of constructing meaning that involves producing and receiving and processing information (Brown, 1994).

Based on Richard (2008), mastery of speaking skills in English is a priority for many second-language or foreign-language learners. Consequently, learners often evaluate their success in language learning as well as the effectiveness of their English course on the basis of how much they feel they have improved in their spoken language proficiency.

**Purposes of Speaking**

The purposes of teaching speaking are (1). to produce the English speech sounds and sound patterns, (2). To select appropriate words and sentences according to the proper social setting, audience, situation and subject matter, (3). To use word and sentence stress, intonation patterns and the rhythm of the second language, (4). To organize their thought in a meaningful and logical sequence, and (5). To use the language as means of expressing values and judgements.

Based on Richard (2008) there are numerous attempts have been made to classify the functions of speaking in human interaction. In his research he expanded three-part version of Brown and Yule’s framework (after Jones, 1996, and Burns, 1998) about function of speaking: talk as interaction; talk as transaction; talk as performance. Each of these speech activities is quite distinct in terms of form and function and requires different teaching approaches.

**Motivation**

Gardner (Ellis,1994:509) stated that motivation refers to the directed effort individual learners make to learn the language.In Ellis (1994:515), the notion of intrinsic motivation is an old one in psychology. It was developed as an alternative to goal-directed theories of motivation that emphasize the role of extrinsic reward and punishment. Keller (cited in Ellis, 1994) said interest as one of the main elements of motivation. It as positive response to stimuli based on existing cognitive structure. Fauziati (2011:192-193) stated that second language learners can be intrinsically or extrinsically motivated to succeed in their task.

Several research state in Saputra study (2017) state that there is important relationship between motivation and learning. Pepe, Bell, and Yetkin stated that motivation maintain students for longer study time so it can make the best result. Yet, it very depend how study environment support their motivation of study. Teacher role is very crucial to stimulate motivation because students mostly learn on classroom. a good guidance will help them understand correctly and efficiently which eliminated bad emotion such as anxious or desperation.

**Simulation**

Similar with role play, Brown (2007) elaborate that simulation are more elaborate then role plays. In simulation, props and documents provide a somewhat realistic environment for language practice. Solcova (2011) in her study, state that simulation is a kind of role play with the only difference that learner use realia, that is real object to support teaching learning process.

Silvia in a study state that there are similarity of simulation with role play. It possible that both of the technique provide a practical and real situation as their benefit in supporting teaching learning. Either of them also bring some particular situation and encourage students to learn based on “become another prople” situation for better understanding. Although, Kenner in Silvie argue that simulation give a chance students to apply more theory, develop critical skill, and provide a welcome relief from the everyday task of reading and preparing for classes.

**Role Play**

Role play is a technique that allows students to explore realistic situation by interacting with other people in a managed way in order to develop experience. According to Ladousse
in Kusnierek (2015) Role play can be defined as one of whole gamut of communicative techniques which develops fluency in language students, which promotes interaction in the classroom and which increase motivation. Not only peer learning encourage by it, but also sharing between teacher and students of the responsibility for the learning process.

Moreover, Role play can be very useful dress rehearsal for real life, especially for people who are learning English for professional purpose. It fits the desire for realism, since it gives the students the chance to rehearse the typical activities. Another function that very important of the usage of this technique is it can be as facilitator for linguistic item memorization. Role play provide physical and visual reinforcement that increase involvement and helps to fix vocabulary, structures and grammar (Kusnierek; 2015).

**Criteria of Speaking**

In order to explain how students achieve better speaking skill, this research was taking score by using five criteria. First criteria is Vocabulary and as Manser in Susilowati (2012) define vocabulary as total number of word in a language or list of word with their meaning. This criteria has a massive reflection toward people speaking skill in order to express their idea. Lacking of vocabulary cause a gap in every conversation.

Second criteria is pronunciation. Rui Ma (2015) in her study explain that pronunciation is related referential meaning by stress and intonation of target language. People who has good speaking skill produce a proper utterance and can be comprehend by listener in every word.

Effort is the third criteria to measure a good speaking skill. Pace in Utami (2012) that “quality of student effort is defined as how much voluntary behavior or personal investment a student makes for their education. It has been examined as how often students carry out learning activities, such as taking detailed notes during class”. giving proper appreciation on students’ effort is very important to bring encouragement in learning process.

Fluency as the next criteria, commonly define by Fillmore in Richard (1990) as an ability to talk in coherent and fill time with talk. In other definition, this word can be define as “flow” in latin origin. People with a good speaking skill tend to more fluent, accurate, smooth, lucid, and efficient when they engage conversation.

The last criteria is Creativity as Jarger in Wolf (2012) explain as the abilities that are most characteristic of creative people. In line with Jarger, Gerlovina (2011) explain can be define as ability to produce something appropriate, generative, and influential. It may not directly measure people speaking skill, but in context of role play and simulation technique. Creativity appreciation provide students encouragement.

**Research Design**

This research use experimental research design as a core. This kind of research has unique way to directly attempts to influence a particular variable and can really test hypothesis about cause-and-effect relationship. In experimental research design, there will be two group of sample that represent data. They are experimental group and control group. In the end of the post test of both group will be compared.

The subject of the research are the eleventh grade students of Tarcisius vocational high school Semarang. Sample choose by using random sampling which every participant have same and equal chance of being assigned. Researcher choose two different classes with thirty five students in every class. As the variable of this research is motivation as independent variable and teaching technique as dependent variable.

This research conducted quantitative data analysis and statistical model. Analysis of Variance or ANOVA analyze the different between two group and the associated procedures such as “variation” among and
between groups. t-test and z-test conducted to support ANOVA

**Finding**

**Comparative Mean Testing Simulation Technique and Role Play**

According to calculation by using SPSS, researcher obtain mean data and standard deviation simulation technique and role play, as follow:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Technique</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>Std. Error Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Simulation</td>
<td>85.32</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>5,618</td>
<td>1.009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Role Play</td>
<td>67.10</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>4,962</td>
<td>.891</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.1 Comparative Mean Testing Simulation Technique and Role Play

Testing steps:

1. Determine \( H_0 \) which states speaking skill learning score evaluation by using simulation technique obtain same result with role play
2. Determine \( H_a \) which states speaking skill learning score evaluation by using simulation obtain significantly better result than role play
3. Determine

\[
Z_{\text{Count}} = \frac{\bar{X}_1 + \bar{X}_2}{\sqrt{\frac{S_1^2}{n_1} + \frac{S_2^2}{n_2}}} = \frac{85.32 - 67.10}{\sqrt{\frac{(5,618)^2}{31} + \frac{(4,962)^2}{31}}} = 8.3
\]

4. The result of testing above shows that \( Z \)-count is bigger than \( Z \)-table (8.3 > 1.64). it means that \( H_0 \) is rejected and \( H_a \) is accepted. Thus, speaking skill learning result evaluation by using simulation technique significantly obtain better result then role play

**Significance Learning Result of Motivated students by using Simulation**

High motivation toward simulation technique

According to the result of SPSS processing data, it is identified from the regression equation and hypothesis testing of the influence of students with high motivation toward learning result by using simulation technique and can be seen on the table 2 below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
<td>Beta</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 (Constant)</td>
<td>62,146</td>
<td>8,999</td>
<td></td>
<td>6,906</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High Motivation</td>
<td>591</td>
<td>206</td>
<td>559</td>
<td>2.861</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.2 High Motivation Towards Simulation technique Coefficient.
The Effectiveness

Table 4.4 High Motivation Towards Role Play Coefficient.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
<td>Beta</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>50.571</td>
<td>7.670</td>
<td>6.593</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High Motivation</td>
<td>0.461</td>
<td>0.190</td>
<td>0.477</td>
<td>2.428</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: processed primary data

High Motivation Toward Role Play

According to the result of SPSS precessing data, be able to obtain regression equation and hypothesis testing of the influence of students with high motivations toward learning result by using role play and can be seen on the table below

Dependent variable (y): Simulation technique
Independent Variable (x): High Motivation

Data result shows regression equation Y = 62.146 + 0.591 x this can be interpreted as follow:
1. Constant number 62.146 show if motivation (X) = 0, that is students did not have motivation, then student will obtain learning result taught by using simulation technique 62.146
2. Regression coefficient 0.591 means that if motivation goes up one unit then the value of learning result will increase 0.591 as well

High motivation impact toward simulation technique can be proceed by hypothesis testing with t-test as follows:
1. Determine H₀ which state high motivation students do not obtain significance learning result score by using simulation technique
2. Determine t-table value with alpha (α) 5% or 0.05 and degree of freedom (df) n-2=20-2=18. T-table value obtained 1.734 with one right side testing
3. Determine t-count value which can be found on table above as 2.861
4. Testing conclusion shows that t-count value more than t-table value (2.861>1.734) means that t-count located in rejection area. then H₀ is rejected and H₀ is accepted. Significance number 0.010 less than alpha (α) 0.05 shows H₀ significance is accepted. Thus high motivation students obtain significance learning result score by using simulation technique

Significance Learning Result of Motivated students by using Role play

High Motivation Toward Role Play

According to the result of SPSS precessing data, be able to obtain regression equation and hypothesis testing of the influence of students with high motivations toward learning result by using role play and can be seen on the table below

Dependent variable (y): Role play
Independent Variable (x): High motivation

Data result shows regression equation Y = 50.571 + 0.461 x this can be interpreted as follow:
1. Constant number 50.571 show if motivation (X) = 0, then students with high motivation will obtain learning result taught by using role play 50.571
2. Regression coefficient 0.461 means that if motivation goes up one unit then the value of learning result will increase 0.461 as well

High motivation impact toward role play can be proceed by hypothesis testing with t-test as follows:
1. Determine H₀ which state high motivation students do not obtain significance learning result score by using role play
2. Determine t-table value with alpha (α) 5% or 0.05 and degree of freedom (df) n-2=22-2=20. T-table value obtained 1.725
3. Determine t-count value which can be found on table above as 2.428
4. Testing conclusion shows that t-count value more than t-table value (2.428>1.725) means that t-count located in rejection area. then H₀ is rejected and H₀ is accepted. Testing can also be proceed by comparing significance value and alpha (α) value. Significance number 0.025 less than alpha (α) 0.05 shows H₀ significance is accepted. Thus high motivation students still obtain significance learning result even by using role play.
Low Motivation Toward Role Play

According to the result of SPSS precessing data, be able to obtain regression equation and hypothesis testing of the influence of students with low motivations toward learning result by using role play and can be seen on the table below:

**Table 4.5 Low Motivation Towards Role Play Coefficient.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>39,444</td>
<td>2,288</td>
<td>.056</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Low Motivation</td>
<td>833</td>
<td>.447</td>
<td>1.323</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: processed primary data
Dependent variable (y): Role play
Independent Variable (x): Low motivation

Data result shows regression equation

\[ Y = 39.444 + 0.833 \times \]

this can be interpreted as follow:

1. Constante number 39.444 show if motivation \((X) = 0\), then students with low motivation will obtain learning result taught by using role play 39.444
2. Regression coefficient 0.833 means that if motivation goes up one unit then the value of learning result will increase 0.833 as well

Low motivation impact toward role play can be proceed by hypothesis testing with t-test as follows:

1. Determine \(H_0\) which state low motivation students do not obtain significance score by using role play
2. Determine \(H_a\) which state low motivation students obtain significance learning result by using role play
3. Determine t-table value with alpha \((\alpha)\) 5% or 0.05 and degree of freedom \((df)\) n-2=9-2=7. T-table value obtained 1.895
4. Determine t-count value which can be found on table above as 1.323
5. Testing conclusion shows that t-count value less than t-table value (1.323<1.895) means that t-count located in rejection area. then \(H_0\) is accepted and \(H_a\) is rejected. Testing can also be proceed by comparing significance value and alpha \((\alpha)\) value. Significance number 0.227 more than alpha \((\alpha)\) 0.05 shows \(H_a\) significance is rejected. Thus low motivation students do not obtain significance learning result by using role play.

Discussion

This study mainly focusing on how motivation will bring significance result toward speaking achievement in order to achieve a best result. Speaking skill as main topic was chosen to solve a big trouble of mastering English as foreign language. Harmer (2007) and Oorade (2012) cited their concern toward this issue on their study. Both of them similarly explain that speaking is the most difficult skill to master because speaking happens in real time and as foreign language, environment do not the usage of English in daily life which is very important to mastering language.

The first issue that researcher concern is which teaching technique is better in order to achieve better speaking skill achievement. sub chapter 4.1 delivers a massage that simulation technique bring better result than role play by using comparative mean testing. Post-test score of simulation technique way better than role play method (85.32 > 67.10). This result may strengthen Rianis’ research that conducted on 2011 who find out the effectiveness of simulation technique to teach speaking skill compared with audiolingual method. In line with this study result, Riani obtain higher mean (61.7) than audiolingual (58.6)

The final issue is when motivation become a variable which bring significance influence toward the result of speaking achievement by using simulation technique and role play. The finding above on Chapter 4.2 and 4.3 explained that high motivation students tend to obtain better result than low motivation students. This result happend in result of Hawley statement who state that motivation bring a good consistency in their study, do more and faster activities.

Conclusion

Based on finding above, be able to conclude as follow:

1. Speaking skill learning result by using simulation technique significantly better than role play.
2. High motivation students significantly influence toward speaking skill learning result by using simulation technique.

3. Low motivation students significantly influence toward speaking skill learning result by using simulation technique.

4. High motivation students significantly influence toward speaking skill learning result by using role play.

5. Low motivation students do not significantly influence toward speaking skill learning result by using role play.

Suggestion

1. To achieve better learning result on speaking skill, it is necessary to apply and improve the simulation technique.

2. Simulation technique also need further research in more variant of school in purpose to increase the capability of this learning technique. Then it can be developed rapidly and can reach for every level of education, especially in English to improve speaking skill.

References


Solcova, B.P. 2011. Teaching Speaking Skills. Published Thesis. Masaryk University Faculty of Arts.


Wolf, Roger. 2012, Defining the Concept of Creativity. Published Thesis : University of Twente. Netherland.